

MINUTES OF THE MEETING

AGENDA: REDRESSES OF GRIEVANCES OF BIDDERS REGARDING PROCUREMENT OF BIOMEDICAL EQUIPMENT FOR SCHEME 'UP-GRADATION OF THQ HOSPITAL, BUREWALA FROM 60-BEDS TO 150-BEDDED HOSPITAL' FOR THE FISCAL YEAR 2019-20.

Date & Time: 19.08.2020 @ 01:00 pm

Venue: Committee Room THQ Burewala

A meeting of the Grievance Redressal Committee was held to redress the grievances of the bidders, as per Rule 67 of Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014, for procurement of biomedical equipment for scheme 'Up-Gradation of THQ Hospital, Burewala from 60-Beds to 150-Bedded Hospital' for Fiscal Year 2019-20.

Following members participated in the meeting:-

- | | |
|---|----------|
| 1. Senior Consultant ENT, THQ Hospital, Burewala | Chairman |
| 2. Radiologist, THQ Hospital, Burewala | Member |
| 3. Chest Specialist, THQ Hospital, Burewala | Member |
| 4. Cardiologist, THQ Hospital, Burewala | Member |
| 5. Kashif Rehman Pharmacist, THQ Hospital, Burewala | Member |

The Representative of the following firm were also present:-

1. M/s Vertex Medical Pvt. Ltd
2. M/s Everest Pharmmedica Pvt. Ltd
3. M/s Total Technologies
4. M/s Allmed Solution
5. M/s Verizon

PROCEEDING:

1. Background of the case is that Tehsil Headquarter Hospital Burewala invited bids for procurement of Biomedical Equipment through advertisement in national press (Daily Times & Dunya, Multan) on 31.05.2020 (IPL-4372) & websites of Punjab Procurement Regularity Authority Punjab. The process was initiated for the recommended list of Biomedical Equipment for Tehsil Headquarter Hospital Burewala. In response there to, 08 tenders were received tender for Medical Equipment and opened on 22.06.2020 at 1-00PM.
2. The finalized technical evaluation report was uploaded on the official website of THQ Hospital, Burewala on Dated: 25-07-2020. Against the Technical Evaluation Report, Grievances were received from aggrieved bidders up to 05-08-2020 which were placed before the Grievance Redressal Committee for decision.
3. The case wise proceedings of the meeting are as follows:-

OPERATING LAPAROSCOPE ADULT

- 3 firms participated in the tender
- 1 firm M/s Vertex medical Pvt. Ltd, Lahore was technically non-responsive
- 3 firms M/s Verizon, Lahore, Vertex Medical Lahore and M/s Allmed Solution, Karachi were substantially responsive
- 3 grievances were received and addressed by the committee

Grievance No.	01
Name of Firm	M/s Vertex Medical Pvt. Ltd, Lahore
Item No.13 (A)	Operating Laparoscope Adult, Model: Multi items, Make: Aesculap Germany
Bid Status	Non-Responsive
Health Facility	Surgery Department THQ Burewala

Reasons of Rejections	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ PV480+PV485 CMOS Instead of 3CCD Camera full HD ▪ Control of peripheral i.e. light source, recording system parameter via camera head button ▪ L Shaped dissecting electrode /diathermy size 5mm, insulated, length 33-36 cm (L-hook dissector) not offered? ▪ Coagulating and dissecting electrode, spatula-shaped, blunt with connector pin for unipolar coagulation, size 5 mm, working length 33-36cm not offered?
<u>DECISION</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ M/s Vertex Medical Pvt. Ltd submitted their grievance to the grievance Redressal Committee. ○ The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of technical evaluation report and technical literature of the quoted product provided by the firm M/s Vertex Medical Pvt. Ltd. ○ The deficiency pertaining to control of peripheral via camera head button had been furnished through technical literature while 3CCD had not been resolved ○ They had also furnished the details of instruments ○ So the committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby rejected and the status of the firm is declared as "Non-Responsive".

Grievance No.	02
Name of Firm	M/s Verizon, Lahore
Item No.13 (A)	Operating Laparoscope Adult, Model: Multi Items, Make: Richard Wolf Germany
Bid Status	Non-Responsive
Health Facility	Surgery Department THQ Burewala
Reasons of Rejections	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Control of peripheral i.e. light source, recording system parameter via camera head button ▪ UPS Make/Model not provided ▪ Co2 cylinder details not provided
<u>DECISION</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ M/s Verizon submitted their grievance to the grievance Redressal Committee ○ The committee examined the view point of the firm in the light of technical evaluation report and technical literature of the quoted product provided by the firm M/s Verizon, Lahore ○ The deficiency pertaining to control of peripheral via camera head button had been furnished through technical literature while deficiency regarding UPS, Co2 cylinders had been resolved through provision of undertaking that they will provide said items as per requirement. ○ So the committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby accepted and the status of the firm is declared as "Responsive".

Grievance No.	03
Name of Firm	M/s Allmed Solution
Item No.13 (A)	Operating Laparoscope Adult, Make: Multi Items, Make: Karl Storz Switzerland
Bid Status	Non-Responsive
Health Facility	Surgery Department THQ Burewala
Reasons of Rejections	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Control of peripheral i.e. light source, recording system parameter via camera head button ▪ UPS Make/Model not provided ▪ Co2 cylinder details not provided
<u>DECISION</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ M/s Allmed Solution submitted their grievance to the grievance Redressal Committee. ○ The committee examined the view point of the firm in the light of technical evaluation report and technical literature of the quoted product provided by the firm M/s Allmed Solution, Karachi. ○ The deficiency pertaining to control of peripheral via camera head button had been furnished through technical literature while deficiency regarding UPS, Co2 cylinders

- had been resolved through provision of undertaking that they will provide said items as per requirement.
- So the committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby accepted and the status of the firm is declared as **“Responsive”**

CENTRAL SUPPLY SYSTEM


- 5 firms participated in the tender
- 2 firms M/s Total Technologies and M/s Eastern Medical were technically responsive
- 3 firms M/s Allmed Solution, M/s Bestech and M/s Everest Pharmedica, Lahore were technically non-responsive responsive
- 3 grievances were received and addressed by the committee

Grievance	01
Name of Firm	M/s Total Technologies
Item No. 1	Central Supply System, Model: Multi items, Make: Beacon Medaes, UK
Bid Status	Responsive
Health Facility	THQ Burewala
Reasons of Rejections	▪ N/A
DECISION	M/s Total Technologies submitted their grievance to the grievance Redressal Committee against M/s Eastern Medical and M/s Everest Pharmedica. The committee examined the view point of the firm in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievances submitted by M/s Total Technologies against M/s Eastern Medical is rejected while against M/s Everest Pharmedica is hereby accepted and status of the firms is declared as same as in the technical evaluation report.


Grievance	02
Name of Firm	M/s Everest Pharmedica
Item No. 1	Central Supply System, Model: Multi items, Make: P3, UK
Bid Status	Non-Responsive
Health Facility	THQ Hospital Burewala
Reasons of Rejections	During clarification of bid the firm change the quote pertaining to dryer & filtration system that is against the bidding documents clause 26 sub clause 26.1, " During evaluation of the bids, the procuring agency may , at its discretion, ask the bidder for a clarification of its bids, as provided in rule 33 of PPRA 2014. The request for clarification and the response shall be in writing and no change in the prices of substance of bid like indication or re-indication of make/model/brand etc. shall be sought, offered or permitted
DECISION	M/s Everest Pharmedica submitted their grievance to the grievance Redressal Committee. The committee examined the view point of the firm in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby rejected and the status of the firm is declared as “Non-Responsive” .


Grievance	03
Name of Firm	M/s Allmed Solution
Item No.1	Central Supply System, Model: Multi items, Make: G Samaras SA, Greece
Bid Status	Non-Responsive
Health Facility	THQ Hospital Burewala

Reasons of Rejections	During clarification of bid the firm change the quote pertaining to duplex compressors, dryer & filtration system that is against the bidding documents clause 26 sub clause 26.1, " During evaluation of the bids, the procuring agency may , at its discretion, ask the bidder for a clarification of its bids, as provided in rule 33 of PPRA 2014. The request for clarification and the response shall be in writing and no change in the prices of substance of bid like indication or re-indication of make/model/brand etc shall be sought, offered or permitted
<u>DECISION</u>	M/s Allmed Solution submitted their grievance to the grievance Redressal Committee. The committee examined the view point of the firm in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby rejected and the status of the firm is declared as "Non-Responsive" .


Kashif Rehman
Pharmacist THQ Burewala
(Member)


Chest Specialist
THQ Burewala
(Member)


Senior Consultant ENT
THQ Burewala
(Chairman)


Cardiologist
THQ Burewala
(Member)


Radiologist
THQ Burewala
(Member)